Transforming Health Care in Turkey: Achievements and Controversy

A. Serdar Atav, PhD
Associate Professor
Decker School of Nursing, Binghamton University
Binghamton, New York

Purpose

- Describe the main components of the recent reforms in health care (The Health Transformation Program) in Turkey
- Analyze the effects of the program on health indicators
- Discuss potential impact of the program on public health and nursing
- Examine controversial components of the program

The Turkish Context

- Bridge between Europe and Asia
- Slightly larger than Texas
- 17th largest economy in the world
- In the last quarter, fastest growing economy in the world
- Population of 75 million
- GDP per capita - about $14,700
- The only stable secular democracy in the world with a large Muslim majority

Turkish Context

- Prior to 2003, major issues with the health care delivery system:
  - Poor population health status indicators
  - Disparities between rural / urban as well as low / middle income families
  - Major inefficiencies in health care delivery
  - Excessive fragmentation
  - Incomplete health insurance coverage
  - Duplication of services
  - Low productivity and technical quality
  - Shortages of facilities and personnel in the East and South-East parts of Turkey

Map of Turkey

Dr. Atav has no relationships to disclose.
**Why Are Health Reforms Needed?**

- Cost of health care:
  - Globally, health care costs are increasing rapidly
  - Effects of aging population on health care costs
  - Increases in non-communicable, chronic diseases
  - Adoption of new technologies

**Why Are Health Reforms Needed?**

- Changes in expectations
  - Economic reasons
    - As countries get wealthier, they tend to spend more on health care
  - Social reasons
    - As communications and travel expand across the world, individuals are aware of better health care provisions
  - Political reasons
    - In democratic societies, politicians need to respond to higher expectations in health care

---

**Health Transformation Program**

- Developed by the Turkish Ministry of Health under the majority government of conservative/religious leaning AK Party.
- With the overall objective of improving:
  - Governance
  - Efficiency
  - User and provider satisfaction
  - Long-term fiscal sustainability
- Initial financing by a loan from the World Bank ($130 million)

---

**Major Components of the Health Transformation Program**

- Strengthening Ministry of Health’s capacity for effective stewardship
- Universal health insurance
- Reorganizing health service delivery
- Human resource development
- National health information system

---

**Effective Stewardship by the Ministry of Health:**

- Transition of the ministry from mainly being a provider of services to being a policy maker and regulator of service provision
- Strong decentralization
- Criticized as a neo-liberal approach

---

**Universal Health Insurance**

- Establishment of a single health insurance fund by means of consolidating four existing schemas
- Expansion of health insurance to all Turkish citizens
- Premium based insurance
- Criticized for not being based on general taxation
Reorganization of the delivery system

- Adoption of family medicine as an organizational model for delivery of outpatient or primary services
  - Per capita payments to family physicians up to 3,500 patients
- Greater autonomy to public hospitals
- New patient referral system
- Improving public health programs through community health centers
- Criticized for not being truly family or community oriented

Human Resource Development

- Health personnel education
- Restructuring of work schedules of physicians in the public sector (full time only)
- Training of physicians (not nurses) for family medicine
- Performance based supplementary payment system
- Criticized by all professional organizations for favoring private and private hospital practice

National Health Information System

- Development of standards
- Establishment of the infrastructure
- Establishment of information flows between various components of the health care system
- National health data bases
- All stakeholders seem to support this effort

Accomplishments:

- Nearly all Turkish citizens are under a single insurance system
- Freedom to choose a family physician
- Freedom to choose any public hospital
- Freedom to choose participating private hospitals with higher co-pays
- Community health center in each city/town
- Nearly completed National Health Information System

Possible Impact of Accomplishments

- Infant mortality rates (under 1 year of age) down from 29 per 1000 in 2003 to 10 in 2010
- Life expectancy up from 70.9 to 73.7 (76.1 for women)
- Infant vaccination rates at 97%
- Higher satisfaction rates with health care services (39.5% to 73.1%)
- Burden of out-of-pocket expenditures declined
- Productivity in hospitals improved

Controversies/Criticisms

- Premium based insurance and co-pays are a burden on lower income people
  - $100 per month per person premium
  - Per visit ($2 to $10) and prescription charges ($2)
  - 20% out of pocket medication costs
  - 30% out of pocket private hospital costs
- Urban - Rural differences in quantity and quality of services
- Treatment focus
- Neo-liberal approach with privatization and profit orientation
Controversies – Continued

- Difficulty in coordinating and implementing national preventative health projects
- Possibility of rejection of patients with chronic diseases by family physicians
- Family medicine only as a delivery system to individuals, not to families or communities
- Delays in wider implementation of the family medicine system

Controversies – Continued

- Major health personnel shortages in public hospitals and medical centers
- Strong resistance to change from medical associations
- Nursing lumped together with other support personnel
- Health care expenditures went from $20 billion to $40 billion
- Pharmaceutical expenditures went from $1 billion to $12 billion

Conclusion

- Reform in health care is unavoidable
- Building consensus, even with a very strong central government, is difficult due to ideological orientation of stakeholders
- Even though the Turkish Health Transformation Program has major shortcomings, the public seem to welcome it
- The Health Transformation Program is a reflection of the neo-liberal priorities of the current popular government, which has overseen the impressive socio-economic transformation of the country in the last decade

QUESTIONS?

CONTACT INFO:
A. Serdar Atav, PhD
Associate Professor
Decker School of Nursing
Binghamton University
Binghamton, NY 13902-6000
atav@binghamton.edu