Evidence from nurses and social workers: Social determinants of inequality in health care service delivery as a challenge to achieving wellness across the lifespan

By

Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D.

Professor of Health Education, Coordinator of the Program in Health Education, Director of the Research Group on Disparities in health, Department of Health and Behavior Studies, Teachers College, Columbia University
525 W. 120th Street, New York, NY 10027-6696
BCW3@Columbia.edu  DrBarbaraWallace@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

TOOLS DEVELOPED BY DR. WALLACE FOR USE BY FELLOWS IN THE RGDH

As Founder and Director of the Research Group on Disparities in Health (RGDH), Dr. Dr. Barbara Wallace (this presenter) has created tools for use by pre- and post-doctoral fellows of the RGDH. The RGDH engages in open sharing of these research tools, encouraging fellows to adapt the tools for studies conducted in collaboration with and under the supervision of Dr. Wallace—i.e. the doctoral dissertation sponsor.

CREATION OF THREE RESEARCH TOOLS FOR MEASURING:

(1) ability to perceive racism and/or oppression;
(2) coping responses to racism and/or oppression; and
(3) ratings of inequality in health care service delivery, given what they have observed, specifically when comparing health care service delivery with five demographic groups (i.e. racial, gender, age, SES, and sexual orientation groups).
TOOL # 1 – AN ORIGINAL WALLACE RESEARCH MEASURE USED BY FELLOWS OF THE RGDH

PERCEPTIONS OF RACISM AND OPPRESSION SCALE (PROS-10)

Directions: We are interested in learning about your perceptions of racism and oppression.

For Your Information: Racism and oppression are potentially stressful, negative, harmful experiences where the injured party is sent the message they are “less than,” “unequal,” or “inferior.” For racism, injury is suffered due to one’s race or ethnicity (Asian, Black, Hispanic, etc…). For oppression, injury is suffered due to one’s characteristics (female, poor, gay/lesbian/transgender, illegal immigrant, immigrant status, race, religion, ethnicity, etc…). Racism/oppression may include: prejudice, discrimination, harassment, violence, exclusion, disadvantage, or lack of access to opportunity—whether while driving, eating out, walking around, shopping, voting, hailing down a taxi, interacting with police, searching for employment, seeking health care, applying for a bank loan/mortgage, searching for housing, negotiating the criminal justice system, working, traveling, vacationing, or seeking out literally any opportunity etc….

Please answer the following questions.

IN TERMS OF EXPERIENCES OF RACISM AND/OR OPPRESSION...

1. I am not sure if it really exists or happens to people.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

2. When incidents are talked about, I am not sure what makes something racist or oppressive.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

3. I think it never happens to me.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

4. There are times when I “don’t get it,” or I can’t really tell when it is happening to me.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

5. I think it never happens to others.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

6. There are times when I “don’t get it,” or I can’t really tell when it is happening to others.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

7. I can usually see or sense when it is happening to me.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

8. I can usually see or sense when it is happening to others.
   1.__Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided    4.__Disagree    5.__Strongly Disagree

© 2012 Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D.  BCW3@Columbia.edu  APHA 2012
9. When incidents are talked about, I think, “That could happen to me or someone I love.”
   1. __Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3. __Undecided   4. __Disagree   5. __Strongly Disagree

10. When incidents are talked about, I can identity with and understand the experience.
   1. __Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3. __Undecided   4. __Disagree   5. __Strongly Disagree

Thank you.

________________________________

SCORING INSTRUCTIONS AND SCALES ON THE PERCEPTIONS OF RACISM AND OPPRESSION SCALE (PROS-10)

The PROS-10 has the following sub-scales:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCALES</th>
<th>ITEM #s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R/OE Scale (Racism/Oppression Exists Scale)</td>
<td>#1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGP Scale (Ability to Generally Perceive Racism/Oppression Scale)</td>
<td>#2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R/OS Scale (Racism/Oppression Perceived in Relation to Self Scale)</td>
<td># 3, 4, 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R/OO Scale (Racism/Oppression Perceived in Relation to Others Scale)</td>
<td># 5, 6, 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Scale (Identification with Victims of Racism/Oppression Scale)</td>
<td># 9, 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTE: Reverse Scored Items: #s 1–6.

A low score means a self-reported ability to perceive racism and oppression that is adequate, whereas a high score means a lack of an adequate ability to perceive racism and oppression.

_______________________________

TOOL # 2 – AN ORIGINAL WALLACE RESEARCH MEASURE USED BY FELLOWS OF THE RGDH

COPING AND RESPONDING TO RACISM AND OPPRESSION STAGING SCALE (CRROSS-20)

Directions: We are interested in learning how you cope with and respond to racism and oppression.

For Your Information: Racism and oppression are potentially stressful, negative, harmful experiences where the injured party is sent the message they are “less than,” “unequal,” or “inferior.” For racism, injury is suffered due to one’s race or ethnicity (Asian, Black, Hispanic, etc…). For oppression, injury is suffered due to one’s characteristics (female, poor, gay/lesbian/transgender, illegal immigrant, immigrant status, race, religion, ethnicity, etc…). Racism/oppression may include: prejudice, discrimination, harassment, violence, exclusion, disadvantage, or lack of access to opportunity—whether while driving, eating out, walking around, shopping, voting, hailing down a
taxi, interacting with police, searching for employment, seeking health care, applying for a bank loan/mortgage, searching for housing, negotiating the criminal justice system, working, traveling, vacationing, or seeking out literally any opportunity etc….

Please answer the following questions.

**PART I - IN TERMS OF EXPERIENCES OF RACISM AND/OR OPPRESSION...**

1. I don’t think they exist, so there is nothing to learn how to cope with or respond to.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

2. I never thought about how to cope with or respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

3. I have thought about how to cope with and respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

4. I never took steps to learn more about how to cope with and respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

5. I am planning to take steps to learn more about how to cope with and respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

6. I have been actively learning how to cope with and respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5._Strongly Disagree

7. I have learned how to cope and respond when it is happening to me.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

8. I have learned how to cope and respond when it is happening to others.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

9. Sometimes I feel I need to learn new or better ways to cope with and respond to it.
   1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

10. My ability to cope with and respond to it has reached a steady level, a plateau, or stable state.
    1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

11. My ability to cope with and respond to it is something that improves over time, getting better.
    1.__Strongly Agree   2. __Agree   3.__Undecided   4.__Disagree   5.__Strongly Disagree

12. I “relapsed,” or stopped doing some of the things I used to do to cope and respond.
1. __Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided     4.__Disagree     5.__Strongly Disagree

13. I “relapsed,” or stopped doing some of the things I used to do to cope and respond, but now I am thinking about returning to what I used to do.
1. __Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided     4.__Disagree     5.__Strongly Disagree

14. I “relapsed,” or stopped doing some of the things I used to do to cope and respond, but now I am thinking about learning new and better ways to cope and respond.
1. __Strongly Agree    2. __Agree    3.__Undecided     4.__Disagree     5.__Strongly Disagree

PART I - NOTE: In this section, the options for answers are different for questions #15-20.

15. Learning how to cope with and respond to it is something that I have been actively working on:
   __never in my life    __< 1 month    __< 6 months    __> 6 months    __1-3 years    __4-6 years
   __7-9 years    __10-20 years    __21-30 years    __> 31 years    __unsure

16. I rate my ability to cope with and respond to it as:
   __Excellent    __Very Good    __Good    __Fair    __Poor    __Very Poor    __Unsure
   __Not applicable (Racism/oppression don’t exist)

17. The last time I felt like I needed to learn new or better ways to cope with and respond to it was:
   (checking all that apply)
   __never in my life    __in the past week    __in the past month    __in the past 6 months
   __in the past year    __in the past 5 years    __in the past 6-10 years    __11-20 years ago
   __21-30 years ago    __31-40 years ago    __> 41 years ago    __unsure

18. The availability of resources to help people learn ways to cope and respond to it is
   __Excellent    __Very Good    __Good    __Fair    __Poor    __Very Poor    __Unsure
   __Not applicable (Racism/oppression don’t exist)

19. My ability to access resources to help me learn ways to cope and respond to it is
   __Excellent    __Very Good    __Good    __Fair    __Poor    __Very Poor    __Unsure
   __Not applicable: Racism/oppression don’t exist __Not applicable: I don’t need to learn more

20. My use of available resources to help me learn ways to cope and respond to it is
   __Excellent    __Very Good    __Good    __Fair    __Poor    __Very Poor    __Unsure
   __Not applicable: Racism/oppression don’t exist __Not applicable: I don’t need to learn more

Thank you.
SCORING – Determine Stage of Change for Actively Coping with Racism and/or Oppression—whether precontemplation, contemplation, preparation, action (< 6 months), maintenance (>6 months), or relapse.

---

TOOL # 3 – AN ORIGINAL WALLACE RESEARCH MEASURE USED BY FELLOWS OF THE RGDH

HEALTH CARE DELIVERY SURVEY (HCDS-33)

Instructions

The following questions provide an opportunity for you to consider your experiences observing health care delivery. You are asked to indicate for each of five groups of patients (i.e., gender, age, racial/ethnic, socioeconomic status, and sexual orientation groups) which members of those groups (e.g., men or women) receive the superior and the inferior level of treatment for some particular aspect of health care delivery. Depending upon your observations, you may need to check two or several members of a group (e.g., checking both Middle and Low SES). You may also check for any given group, “neither” receives superior or inferior care, as well as “not sure.”

| 1a. Which group(s) receive the best quality treatment? |  
| For gender groups: |  
| __Men | __Women | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For age groups: |  
| ___Children | ___Adults | ___Seniors | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For racial/ethnic groups: |  
| ___Whites | ___Blacks | ___Hispanics | ___Asians | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For socioeconomic status (SES) groups: |  
| ___High SES | ___Middle SES | ___Low SES | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For sexual orientation groups: |  
| ___Heterosexuals | ___Gay Men | ___Lesbians | __Neither | __Not Sure |  

| 1b. Which group(s) receive the worst quality treatment? |  
| For gender groups: |  
| __Men | __Women | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For age groups: |  
| ___Children | ___Adults | ___Seniors | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For racial/ethnic groups: |  
| ___Whites | ___Blacks | ___Hispanics | ___Asians | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For socioeconomic status (SES) groups: |  
| ___High SES | ___Middle SES | ___Low SES | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For sexual orientation groups: |  
| ___Heterosexuals | ___Gay Men | ___Lesbians | __Neither | __Not Sure |  

| 2a. Which group(s) wait the least amount of time to be assessed? |  
| For gender groups: |  
| __Men | __Women | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For age groups: |  
| ___Children | ___Adults | ___Seniors | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For racial/ethnic groups: |  
| ___Whites | ___Blacks | ___Hispanics | ___Asians | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For socioeconomic status (SES) groups: |  
| ___High SES | ___Middle SES | ___Low SES | __Neither | __Not Sure |  
| For sexual orientation groups: |  
| ___Heterosexuals | ___Gay Men | ___Lesbians | __Neither | __Not Sure |
For gender groups:
___Men   ___Women   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For age groups:
___Children   ___Adults   ___Seniors   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For racial/ethnic groups:
___Whites   ___Blacks   ___Hispanics   ___Asians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For socioeconomic status (SES) groups:
___High SES   ___Middle SES   ___Low SES   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For sexual orientation groups:
___Heterosexuals   ___Gay Men   ___Lesbians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

2b. Which group(s) wait the **longest** amount of time to be assessed?

For gender groups:
___Men   ___Women   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For age groups:
___Children   ___Adults   ___Seniors   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For racial/ethnic groups:
___Whites   ___Blacks   ___Hispanics   ___Asians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For socioeconomic status (SES) groups:
___High SES   ___Middle SES   ___Low SES   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For sexual orientation groups:
___Heterosexuals   ___Gay Men   ___Lesbians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

3a. Which group(s) wait the **shortest** amount of time to receive treatment?

For gender groups:
___Men   ___Women   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For age groups:
___Children   ___Adults   ___Seniors   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For racial/ethnic groups:
___Whites   ___Blacks   ___Hispanics   ___Asians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For socioeconomic status (SES) groups:
___High SES   ___Middle SES   ___Low SES   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For sexual orientation groups:
___Heterosexuals   ___Gay Men   ___Lesbians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

3b. Which group(s) wait the **longest** amount of time to receive treatment?

For gender groups:
___Men   ___Women   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For age groups:
___Children   ___Adults   ___Seniors   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For racial/ethnic groups:
___Whites   ___Blacks   ___Hispanics   ___Asians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For socioeconomic status (SES) groups:
___High SES   ___Middle SES   ___Low SES   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

For sexual orientation groups:
___Heterosexuals   ___Gay Men   ___Lesbians   ___Neither   ___Not Sure

4a. Which group(s) experience the **most amount of detail** in their assessment? (e.g., amount of history taken and number of questions asked, etc...)

© 2012 Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D.  BCW3@Columbia.edu  APHA 2012  Page 7
For gender groups:
  ___Men    ___Women    ___Neither    ___Not Sure
For age groups:
  ___Children    ___Adults    ___Seniors    ___Neither    ___Not Sure
For racial/ethnic groups:
  ___Whites    ___Blacks    ___Hispanics    ___Asians    ___Neither    ___Not Sure
For socioeconomic status (SES) groups:
  ___High SES    ___Middle SES    ___Low SES    ___Neither    ___Not Sure
For sexual orientation groups:
  ___Heterosexuals    ___Gay Men    ___Lesbians    ___Neither    ___Not Sure

ETC... for 33 items...
CONTACT BCW3@COLUMBIA.EDU for entire scale and scoring.

STUDY # 1 CONDUCTED BY A FELLOW IN THE RGDH WITH DR. WALLACE USING THE THREE TOOLS


Dissertation Sponsor and Creator of Research Tools Utilized: Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D., Director of the Research Group on Disparities in Health, Teachers College, Columbia University

- In the first study conducted in collaboration with Dr. Wallace, a sample of nurses (n=179) reported on their experiences observing service delivery within hospital settings, indicating that Whites and those of high socioeconomic status (SES) received the best care, while Blacks and those of low SES received the worst care.
- Seniors received significantly worse care relative to that delivered to children and adults. Relative to other racial/ethnic groups,
- Black nurses perceived witnessing a significantly greater gap in health care delivered to Blacks versus Whites, and had a significantly higher ability to perceive racism and/or oppression, as well as a higher level of knowledge about how to cope with and respond to racism and/or oppression.
- Knowledge about how to cope with racism and/or oppression was the only significant predictor of perceiving Whites as receiving better health care than Blacks—accounting for just 9.8% of the variance.
STUDY # 2 CONDUCTED BY A FELLOW IN THE RGDH WITH DR. WALLACE USING THE THREE TOOLS


Dissertation Sponsor and Creator of Research Tools Utilized: Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D., Director of the Research Group on Disparities in Health, Teachers College, Columbia University

- In the second study conducted in collaboration with Dr. Wallace with social workers (n=81), the subjects confirmed the largest gap in health care service delivery was between high SES (best care) and low SES (worse care)
- The next greatest gap was between Whites (best care) and Blacks (worse care).
- Years practicing as a social worker predicted rating adults as receiving better care than children or seniors, as a significant finding—accounting for 17.7% of the variance.

IMPLICATIONS

- Participants are invited to design research studies for any category of health care delivery worker
- Participants will be able to evaluate and analyze data collected, following the methods followed in the studies
- Participants are invited to use the tools in order to contribute to the scientific literature seeking to identify the social determinants (i.e. discrimination in health care service delivery, disparities in health care service delivery, stereotypes, etc…) of inequality in health care service delivery—as a starting point for making improvements.
- Clients may be denied the standard of care as discrimination
- Findings may lead to diversity and cultural competence training in health care settings, or in medical schools, residency training programs, etc…
- Disparities in health service delivery may contribute to health disparities
- Participants can use the tools to further document social determinants of health disparities, to assess a health care setting’s providers, and as a repeated measure pre- and post-implementation of diversity/cultural competence training—in search of perceptions of improvements in health care service delivery following training within a health care settings
- Such diversity/cultural competence training of health care providers may help to overcome current barriers to achieving wellness across the lifespan for Blacks and those of low SES, etc…

THANK YOU!
© 2012 Barbara C. Wallace, Ph.D.  BCW3@Columbia.edu   APHA 2012  Page 9